

## Supplementary Materials for

### **Ozone affects plant, insect, and soil microbial communities: A threat to terrestrial ecosystems and biodiversity**

Evgenios Agathokleous\*, Zhaozhong Feng\*, Elina Oksanen, Pierre Sicard, Qi Wang, Costas J. Saitanis, Valda Araminiene, James D. Blande, Felicity Hayes, Vicent Calatayud, Marisa Domingos, Stavros D. Veresoglou, Josep Peñuelas, David A. Wardle, Alessandra De Marco, Zhengzhen Li, Harry Harmens, Xiangyang Yuan, Marcello Vitale, Elena Paoletti

\*Corresponding author. Email: [evgenios@nuist.edu.cn](mailto:evgenios@nuist.edu.cn) (E.A.); [zhaozhong.feng@nuist.edu.cn](mailto:zhaozhong.feng@nuist.edu.cn) (Z.F.)

Published 12 August 2020, *Sci. Adv.* **6**, eabc1176 (2020)

DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.abc1176

#### **This PDF file includes:**

- Ozone in the atmosphere
- Ozone effects on plant communities
- Global maps of AOT40 and endemism richness
- Table S1
- References

## **Ozone in the atmosphere**

Higher solar radiation, biogenic VOC emission, transport of O<sub>3</sub> from stratosphere to troposphere, and lower O<sub>3</sub> removal by deposition and reactions with NO explain the highest O<sub>3</sub> burdens observed at high elevation (206, 207). Over Greenland and Northeast Siberia, the high O<sub>3</sub> levels can be attributed to high insolation and high levels of reactive compounds (e.g. oxidized nitrogen species) present in the surface layer during the sunlit period due to local sources (e.g. NO<sub>x</sub> emissions from snowpack, PAN decomposition, boreal forest fires) and large-scale O<sub>3</sub> transport and stratospheric O<sub>3</sub> inputs (9, 208–210). Around the Mediterranean basin, high AOT40 values are mainly due to industrial development, road traffic increment, high insolation, sea-land breeze recirculation and long-range transport of O<sub>3</sub> precursors and O<sub>3</sub> (199).

## **Ozone-induced visible foliar injury**

It is well documented that O<sub>3</sub> can cause severe visible injury to exposed plants (211–222). The severity and the distribution of injury to leaves and plants, as well as the appearance (stippling, flecking, bronzing, mottling, chlorosis, discoloration and necrosis) of injury depend on plant species, physiological state, environmental conditions, and duration and nature (acute or chronic) of exposure (214). Acute exposures are characterized by high O<sub>3</sub> concentrations for a relatively short time, restricted to hours or days, while chronic exposures involve lower concentrations that persist or recur over a period of weeks or months (221–223). Stippling, flecking and bifacial necrosis are common visible foliar injuries produced by acute O<sub>3</sub> exposure (221, 224–226), while chlorosis (yellowing or paling of green leaves), upper-surface stippling, premature senescence and necrosis (224, 227, 228) are commonly produced by chronic O<sub>3</sub> exposure.

In broadleaved species, visible foliar O<sub>3</sub> injury is limited to the upper leaf surface, generally categorized as stipple, chlorosis, or fleck (229). Bifacial necrosis may occur at later stages of development. Injury is more severe on mid-aged and older leaves than on younger leaves (224). Sometimes visible injury occurs as a general discoloration, reddening or bronzing between the leaf veins. Stippling is characterized by interveinal, dot-like areas of tan, red, brown, purple or black pigmentation on the upper surface of the leaf (230). The production of stipple requires exposure of the leaf surface to direct sunlight. An overlapping leaf can protect the lower leaf producing a "shadow" in the injury on the leaf surface. Chlorosis is a loss of chlorophyll in the leaf (non-green pigmentation) and appears in relatively discrete patches on the leaves known as mottles. Fleck is characterized by small, discrete areas of dead tissue in the palisade mesophyll. Lesions may be

irregular in shape and range in color from tan to black. Bifacial necrosis is a more severe form of injury resulting from cell death in both the palisade and spongy mesophyll and epidermal tissues. Injury appears on both sides of the leaf and dead tissue may take on a papery texture. Color can range from light tan to black.

Ozone injury on conifer needles generally appears as tipburn or chlorotic mottling. Tipburn is considered to be primarily induced by acute exposure and mottling by chronic exposure. Injury usually progresses from the needle tip to the base (231, 232). Tipburn may become red to brown. Chlorotic mottling is the most common visible injury for conifers. Mottle can be described as discrete patches of similar size, yellow or light green, without sharp borders with the green zones. Chlorotic mottling seems to increase with increasing needle age (216, 233, 234). Furthermore, mottling is more distinct on light-exposed needle areas than on shaded ones.

Visible foliar O<sub>3</sub> injury can be differentiated from symptoms induced by other biotic and abiotic stressors occurring at the same area (219, 235, 236). Ozone-induced injury can be differentiated from fungi and insect damage by in-hand observation of color and pattern of the symptoms (224, 228, 235, 237). Careful observation of chlorotic tissue often reveals a distinct necrotic point at the center of the discolored area, where the insect penetrated the epidermis with its piercing mouth parts (231). Winter fleck, caused by snow and cold temperatures, is a symptom that superficially resembles mottling. These lesions are roundish with distinct margins, tan or brown, and vastly more abundant on the adaxial surface of the needle, suggesting the role of sunlight in their formation (231). The winter flecks on older needles were elucidated at the cell level (236). An injury initially caused by O<sub>3</sub> then aggravated during winter, presumably following the formation of ice crystals at the most damaged locations. The injury was likely further intensified during the following growing season as a consequence of steady oxidative stress at the periphery of the symptomatic area. Needle injury from road salt accumulation, drought, desiccation, winter injury and lightning can be visually distinguished from O<sub>3</sub> injury by the color, shape, pattern of development on the foliage, and occurrence in the tree crown (232, 238).

Intensive research over the last 10 years has led to significant databases about the effects of O<sub>3</sub> exposure on the cell structure both in conifers (particularly *P. cembra* and *P. halepensis*) and broadleaf species (211, 213, 215, 219, 232, 239, 240). Microscopic investigation can be used to validate visible O<sub>3</sub> injury (240, 241).

A first microscopic exam allowed the characterization of the injury: localization, extent, color, and presence of biotic marks. After the correct identification of the suspected injury, a validation was carried out by microscopy on doubtful samples collected during the field survey. The typical ozone injury occurred only in the palisade mesophyll, with lysis followed by the collapse of cells, with tannins and anthocyanin accumulation producing a red-brown necrosis (215, 219, 240, 242, 243).

### **Ozone effects on plant communities**

Table S1 summarizes studies on the responses of communities to O<sub>3</sub>.

### **Global maps of AOT40 and endemism richness**

The areas of high endemism richness of vascular plants (> 200 species per 10,000 km<sup>2</sup>) are: Northern Hemisphere Atlantic islands at high O<sub>3</sub> risk in the latitude band 15-45°N (e.g. Canary islands, Azores and Caribbean), Pacific Islands (Polynesia-Micronesia, Melanesia, Philippines) and Indian Islands (e.g. Madagascar, Seychelles). For the latitude band of the Atlantic islands, the reader may refer to (9, 244, 245); the tropospheric warming is stronger in the latitude band 15-45°N (246). Islands are well-known centers of high levels of endemism, represent 3.6% of the terrestrial surface, and have 26.1% of all worldwide vascular plants (Kier et al., 2009). Among the Islands, Tonga, Indonesia, Japan, New Zealand and Tasmania have lower endemism richness (60-80 species per 10,000 km<sup>2</sup>). From a

global perspective, the island of New Caledonia had by far the highest value with 1,350 vascular plant species per 10,000 km<sup>2</sup> (197). Regarding mainland regions, the endemism richness hot-spots (>50 species per 10,000 km<sup>2</sup>) are observed in California, Tropical Florida, Central and Western South America (Chile, Ecuador and Peru), Guyana, Brazilian coastline, Ethiopia, South Africa, Himalayan and mountains of Southwestern China, Southeastern and extreme Southwestern Australia and around the Mediterranean basin (Fig. 3). If the threshold is set to 20 species per 10,000 km<sup>2</sup>, South America, Equatorial Africa and South Asia are considered hot-spots too. Among mainland areas, regions with Mediterranean-type climate emerge as global centers of plant endemism richness (197). The South African Cape region hosts high endemism richness (771 species per 10,000 km<sup>2</sup>), ranking second among all 90 biogeographic regions.

**Table S1.** Studies on the responses of communities to elevated ozone (O<sub>3</sub>). “g.s.” stands for growing season. AOT40 is the sum of the positive differences between the hourly mean O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio and the threshold of 40 ppb multiplied by the 1-h averaging time, during daylight hours in a defined growing season, depending on the type of vegetation (247).

Study No	Community	Origin of material	Community description	Duration of exposure	Ozone exposure	Main results	Reference
<b>Open-top chambers (OTCs)</b>							
1	Turfs of calcareous grassland.	Twyford Down, Hampshire (51°02'42"N, 1°18'33"W).	Intermediate between the National Vegetation Classification communities CG3d <i>Bromopsis erectus</i> grassland <i>Festuca rubrae</i> - <i>Festuca arundinacea</i> sub-community (EUNIS2004 E1.26 Sub-Atlantic semi-dry calcareous grassland) and MG1 <i>Arrhenatherum elatius</i> grassland <i>F. rubra</i> sub-community (EUNIS2004 E2.22 Sub-Atlantic lowland hay meadows).	3 g.s.	Mean seasonal AOT40≈7.4-18.8 ppm h.	One species was lost from the O <sub>3</sub> treatments, but not the control, and the overall effects on species composition were relatively small.	(51)
2	Artificial communities of species typical of calcareous grasslands	A chalk grassland site in SE England.	'Each mixture contained the same forb species ( <i>Campanula rotundifolia</i> , <i>Leontodon hispidus</i> , <i>Lotus corniculatus</i> and <i>Sanguisorba minor</i> ), but one half had three grass species typical of swards dominated by <i>Festuca ovina</i> ( <i>Briza media</i> , <i>Koeleria macrantha</i> and <i>Festuca ovina</i> ), while the other half of the pots had three grass species typical of swards dominated by	3.5 months	Filtered air, or filtered air with added 50, 70 or 90 ppb O <sub>3</sub> during the	Elevated O <sub>3</sub> changed species composition of the artificial communities, with less forbs with increasing O <sub>3</sub> concentrations above 40 ppb. Elevated O <sub>3</sub> also resulted to more calcareous grassland	(47)

	as well as semi-natural chalk grassland swards.		<i>Festuca rubra</i> ( <i>Bromopsis erectus</i> , <i>Dactylis glomerata</i> and <i>Festuca rubra</i> ).'		daytime.	communities in the semi-natural swards.	
3	Managed pasture composed of grasses, weeds and clover.	A commercial seed company.	Standard seed mixture no. 330 (species not detailed).	2 g.s.	O <sub>3</sub> concentrations 0.50, 0.85, 1.11 and 1.64 times the O <sub>3</sub> concentrations in the ambient air.	Negligible shifts in species composition, a result that might have occurred due to experimental artifacts.	(55)
4	Productive meadow community with two species.	n/a	A mixture of ladino clover ( <i>Trifolium repens</i> cv. Regal) and tall fescue ( <i>Festuca arundinacea</i> cv. Kentucky 31).	2 g.s.	O <sub>3</sub> concentrations 1.3-1.9 times the ambient O <sub>3</sub> concentration.	Reduction of ladino cover fraction to tall fescue.	(59)
5	Early successional plant community.	A research site on the Auburn University (Alabama) campus.	Most prevalent species included: blackberry ( <i>Rubus cuneifolius</i> ), broomsedge bluestem ( <i>Andropogon virginicus</i> ), bahia grass ( <i>Paspalum notatum</i> ), and <i>Panicum</i> spp. Winged sumac ( <i>Rhus copallina</i> ).	2 g.s.	O <sub>3</sub> concentrations 0.5 (filtered), 1.0 and 2.0 times the ambient O <sub>3</sub> concentrations.	Changes in the community structure, with lower species richness, diversity and evenness in the ambient and elevated O <sub>3</sub> treatments than the filtered air; the species dominating canopy cover was different between the filtered air (winged sumac) and the largest O <sub>3</sub> exposure treatment (blackberry).	(49)
6	Semi-natural temperate grassland.	Silwood Park, near Ascot, 32 km west of London. 'The experimental site was an area of semi-natural grassland classified as an <i>Arrhenatheretum elatius-Festuca rubra</i> subcommunity (National Vegetation Classification).'	'The major component species were <i>Agrostis capillaris</i> , <i>Festuca rubra</i> , <i>Poa pratensis</i> , <i>Veronica chamaedrys</i> , <i>Trifolium repens</i> , <i>Plantago lanceolata</i> , and <i>Stellaria gramineae</i> .'	2 g.s.	Ambient air pollution exposure (attributed to O <sub>3</sub> fluctuations).	Forb and legume fraction increased.	(248)

7	Weed community exposed previously to filtered air, 90 ppb O <sub>3</sub> or 120 ppb O <sub>3</sub> , with episodic patterns of varying daily peak concentrations, for four growing seasons.	Weed populations were selected in a long-term O <sub>3</sub> -exposure experiment carried out in Corvallis, Oregon, at the US Environmental Protection Agency Laboratory, Western Ecology Division. The seed banks were transferred to Brazil for experiments.	Twenty species have been identified at different densities in each season: <i>Spergula arvensis</i> , <i>Calandrinia ciliate</i> , <i>Medicago lupulina</i> , <i>Vicia tetrasperma</i> , <i>Rumex crispus</i> , <i>Polygonum persicaria</i> , <i>Taraxacum officinale</i> , <i>Digitaria sanguinalis</i> , <i>Erodium cicutarium</i> , <i>Solanum sarachoides</i> , <i>Raphanus sativus</i> , <i>Echinochloa crusgalli</i> , <i>Chenopodium album</i> , <i>Trifolium repens</i> , <i>Polygonum argyrocoleon</i> , <i>Datura stramonium</i> , <i>Convolvulus arvensis</i> , <i>Tanacetum vulgare</i> , <i>Oxalis corniculata</i> , and <i>Sonchus oleraceus</i> .	2 g.s.	Low pollution in two separate experiments.	Although the species richness of the communities for different O <sub>3</sub> exposure history was similar, the relative abundance of the dominant species was different among the communities; the annual species <i>Spergula arvensis</i> dominated the communities from 90 ppb and <i>Calandrinia ciliate</i> dominated the communities from 120 ppb.	(50)
8	Frequently cut mixtures of ryegrass and white clover.	n/a	Seeds of white clover ( <i>Trifolium repens</i> cv. Ladino California) and perennial ryegrass ( <i>Lolium perenne</i> cv. Bastion) were sown at a weight ratio of 1 : 6.	4 g.s.	Different O <sub>3</sub> exposure regimes in each season, in the range of ≈0.6-1.5 times the O <sub>3</sub> concentration of ambient air.	Clover fraction (in terms of biomass) over ryegrass was reduced by elevated O <sub>3</sub> but only in the first growing season.	(58)
9	Mixture of six species representative of annual pastures.	n/a	Six representative annual species were sown at a density of 1000 seeds m <sup>-2</sup> : 3 legumes ( <i>Trifolium striatum</i> , <i>Trifolium cherleri</i> , <i>Ornithopus compressus</i> ), 2 grasses ( <i>Briza maxima</i> , <i>Cynosurus echinatus</i> ), and 1 herb ( <i>Silene gallica</i> ).	39 days	Filtered air, ambient O <sub>3</sub> , ambient O <sub>3</sub> + 20 ppb and ambient O <sub>3</sub> + 40 ppb.	Legumes were found sensitive to O <sub>3</sub> . In terms of biomass, <i>Ornithopus</i> exhibited positive effects whereas <i>Trifolium</i> species negative effects, thus, <i>Ornithopus</i> took advantage of clover species. This study also showed that within-family competition (here legume) can play the major driver of the overall response of a community.	(42)
10	a) Natural grassland community of <i>Trisetum flavescens</i> ×	A commercial seed bank (Schweizer AG, Thun, Switzerland).	<i>Trisetum flavescens</i> was planted in mixture (mixing proportions: 100:0, 75:25, 50:50, 25:75, and 0:100) with <i>Centaurea jacea</i> and with <i>Trifolium pretense</i> .	1 g.s.	Seasonal episodic exposures (AOT40=8.0-35.5 ppm h).	a) Reduced fraction of clover, in terms of biomass per area, after seasonal episodic exposures at the highest exposure (AOT40=35.5 ppm h) and in moist conditions, but not at	(62)

	<i>Trifolium pratense</i> and b) <i>T. flavescens</i> grown in a community with <i>Centaurea jacea</i> .					the medium exposure (AOT40=14.4 ppm h) or in dry conditions. b) When <i>T. flavescens</i> was grown in a community with <i>Centaurea jacea</i> , the fractions were not affected significantly by O <sub>3</sub> (AOT40=8.0 or 28.0 ppm h).	
11	Northern European lowland hay meadow community.	'Commercial seeds (Kukkiva Niitty) collected from natural populations in south-western Finland.'	'Large mesocosms with species typical to lowland hay meadows (EU Council directive 92). The mesocosms were designed to hold the major functional types of plants that occur on northern European lowland hay meadows: grasses ( <i>Agrostis capillaris</i> , <i>Anthoxanthum odoratum</i> ), herbs ( <i>Fragaria vesca</i> , <i>Campanula rotundifolia</i> , <i>Ranunculus acris</i> ) and legumes ( <i>Trifolium medium</i> , <i>Vicia cracca</i> ).'	3 g.s.	Ambient or elevated O <sub>3</sub> (40-50 ppb; 1.5 × ambient O <sub>3</sub> concentration).	While the community exhibited reduced aboveground biomass and four out of seven species exhibited reduced growth and/or visible injuries in response to elevated O <sub>3</sub> , the dominance of different functional groups was not altered by elevated O <sub>3</sub> .	(249)
12	Grass-clover mixture pasture.	n/a	A mixture of 15% (in terms of seed weight) red clover ( <i>Trifolium pratense</i> cv. 'Fanny'), 60% timothy ( <i>Phleum pratense</i> cv. 'Alexander') and 25% fescue ( <i>Festuca pratensis</i> cv. 'Sval~Sfs Sena').	2 g.s.	Filtered air, ambient O <sub>3</sub> (11.8 and 5.1 ppm h in the first and second growing seasons) or O <sub>3</sub> concentrations ≈1.5 and 2.0 times those in the ambient air.	No significant result suggesting changes in species composition; only a chamber effect was found compared to open plots	(250)
13	A mixture of <i>Trifolium repens</i> (var. Grasslands Huia) and <i>Lolium</i>	n/a	A mixture of <i>Lolium perenne</i> var. Melle (25 kg seed ha <sup>-1</sup> ) and <i>Trifolium repens</i> var. Grasslands Huia (5 kg seed ha <sup>-1</sup> ).	22 days (July-September)	O <sub>3</sub> episodes (4–7 h concentrations of 50–70 nl l <sup>-1</sup> ) and ambient air	Herbage composition was significantly affected by O <sub>3</sub> . Most yield losses were because of less <i>Trifolium</i> , which was more susceptible than <i>Lolium</i> .	(56)



	<i>perenne</i> (var. Melle).				(7-hour mean of 10–28 nl l <sup>-1</sup> ).		
<b>Solardomes</b>							
14	A grassland species mixture with <i>Leontodon hispidus</i> grown with <i>Anthoxanthum odoratum</i> or <i>Dactylis glomerata</i> .	Commercial plug plants (British Wildflower Plants, Norfolk, UK).	Four plants of <i>Leontodon hispidus</i> and three plants of the grass species ( <i>Dactylis glomerata</i> and <i>Anthoxanthum odoratum</i> ).	5 months	Eight background O <sub>3</sub> concentrations ranged 21.4-102.5 ppb	Cover increased with increasing O <sub>3</sub> exposure for both <i>A. odoratum</i> and <i>D. glomerata</i> , increasing the grass: <i>Leontodon</i> cover ratio in both community types.	(33)
15	Mesocosms representing the BAP Priority habitat 'Calcareous Grassland'.	Commercial plug plants (British Wildflower Plants, Norfolk, UK).	Each mesocosm had 2 plugs per the species <i>Briza media</i> and <i>Festuca ovina</i> , and 1 plug per the species <i>Campanula rotundifolia</i> , <i>Sanguisorba minor</i> , <i>Scabiosa columbaria</i> , <i>Helianthemum nummularium</i> and <i>Lotus corniculatus</i> .	2 g.s.	Eight O <sub>3</sub> profiles for twelve-weeks in each g.s. (24 h mean = 15.6-73.0 ppb in the first year and 19.0-73.3 ppb in the second year)	Reduction in flower numbers was found in <i>Campanula rotundifolia</i> and <i>Scabiosa columbaria</i> .	(45)
<b>FACE</b>							
16	Subalpine grassland.	A typical pasture community in the subalpine zone of the European Alps and Pyrenees (EUNIS classification 35.1, <a href="http://eunis.eea.europa.eu/">http://eunis.eea.europa.eu/</a> )	'The most frequent species are <i>Festuca violacea</i> , <i>Nardus stricta</i> and <i>Carex sempervirens</i> , which together account for approximately one-half of the cover. The remaining half is composed of > 70 forb and a few legume species.'	3 g.s.	O <sub>3</sub> concentrations 1.6 times the ambient ones in three growing seasons (AOT40=48.0 ppm h).	No significant effect on the number of species per monolith and the Shannon diversity index.	(63)
17	Semi-natural grassland.	A site at Le Mouret (754 m a.s.l., 46°45'N/7°10'E), Switzerland.	'The plant species composition was identified as an <i>Arrhenatherion elatioris</i> alliance..., confirmed by the presence of <i>Bromus hordeaceus</i> , but without a single dominant species. Important subdominants	5 g.s.	O <sub>3</sub> concentrations approximately 1.5 times	Reduced productivity, in terms of annual dry matter yield, with accompanied shifts in the fractions of functional groups, i.e. grasses, legumes, forbs; legumes fraction	(251)

			included the grasses <i>Holcus lanatus</i> , <i>Trisetum flavescens</i> , <i>Alopecurus pratensis</i> and <i>Arrhenatherum elatius</i> , the nonleguminous forbs <i>Plantago lanceolata</i> with <i>Ranunculus frisianus</i> and the legume <i>Trifolium pratense</i> . A total of 53 species of vascular plants was identified.'		the ambient ones over five growing seasons (AOT40=34.0 ppm h).	appeared more susceptible.	
18	Upland mesotrophic grasslands.	A site located in northern England at High Keenley Fell, about 18 km from Hexham (national grid reference NY 7922 5586 altitude = 360 m).	A <i>Festuca rubra</i> – <i>Holcus lanatus</i> – <i>Anthoxanthum odoratum</i> grassland. Components included: <i>Cerastium arvense</i> , <i>Cerastium fontanum</i> , <i>Chrysosplenium oppositifolium</i> , <i>Conopodium majus</i> , <i>Lathyrus pratensis</i> , <i>Leontodon hispidus</i> , <i>Plantago lanceolata</i> , <i>Polemonium caeruleum</i> , Ranunculaceae, <i>Rhinanthus minor</i> , <i>Rumex acetosa</i> , <i>Taraxacum</i> spp., <i>Trifolium pratense</i> , <i>Trifolium repens</i> , <i>Stellaria graminea</i> , <i>Veronica chamaedrys</i> , <i>Vicia cracca</i> , <i>Vicia hirsuta</i> , <i>Vicia sativa</i> , <i>Vicia sepium</i> .	2 g.s.	Ambient O <sub>3</sub> elevated by mean concentration s of only approximately 4-10 ppb.	Elevated O <sub>3</sub> reduced total biomass of herbs but not of grasses or legumes and affected species composition within the combined herb and legume component but not within grasses component.	(41)
19	Intact subalpine grassland.	A site in the Central Grisons Alps at Alp Flix, Sur, Switzerland (2000 m a.s.l., 9°39'N/46°32'E).	'A typical species-rich pasture community in the tree line zone of the European Alps and Pyrenees, characterized among others by <i>Nardus stricta</i> , <i>Carex sempervirens</i> , <i>Arnica montana</i> , and <i>Gentiana acaulis</i> .'	7 g.s.	Ambient O <sub>3</sub> or O <sub>3</sub> concentration s 1.2 and 1.6 times those of ambient O <sub>3</sub> .	Elevated O <sub>3</sub> did not affect the functional group productivity, and, among 17 species tested, only increased the abundance of <i>Nardus stricta</i> , a slow-growing species with a low specific leaf area; even this resulted to competitive advantage, it was not at the expense of other species abundance.	(52)
<b>Field surveys- associational</b>							
20	Calcifuge grasslands.	Sixty four sites (from southwest England to northern Scotland) were selected from the UK National Vegetation Classification of U4 'Festuca ovinae-Agrostis capillaries-Galium saxatile grasslands', which represent calcifuge	Occurring components included: <i>Festuca rubra</i> , <i>Pseudoscleropodium purum</i> , <i>Hylocomium splendens</i> , <i>Euphrasia officinalis</i> , <i>Plantago lanceolata</i> , <i>Viola riviniana</i> , <i>Rhytidiadelphus triquetrus</i> , <i>Luzula multiflora</i> , <i>Succisa pratensis</i> , <i>Vaccinium vitis-idaea</i> , <i>Lathyrus montanus</i> , <i>Campanula rotundifolia</i> , <i>Anthoxanthum odoratum</i> , <i>Deschampsia flexuosa</i> , <i>Nardus stricta</i> , <i>Hypnum cupressiforme</i> agg., <i>Dicranum scoparium</i> .	1 g.s.	AOT40 was used as an index of O <sub>3</sub> exposure.	Even the sites were not selected according to O <sub>3</sub> gradient species response displayed a decline in O <sub>3</sub> -susceptible species and an increase in O <sub>3</sub> -tolerant plant species with increasing O <sub>3</sub> exposure. This study suggested that O <sub>3</sub> had the highest impact on community composition of acid grasslands (at national level) but has no significant impact on diversity itself, evaluated either by species richness or by diversity indices	(53)

		grasslands widely distributed in the British Isles.				incorporating equitability (Shannon's H or Simpson's D).	
--	--	---	--	--	--	--	--

## REFERENCES AND NOTES

1. A. Biere, A. E. Bennett, Three-way interactions between plants, microbes and insects. *Funct. Ecol.* **27**, 567–573 (2013).
2. J. K. Holopainen, J. D. Blande, Where do herbivore-induced plant volatiles go? *Front. Plant Sci.* **4**, 185 (2013).
3. M. M. Howard, J. Kao-Kniffin, A. Kessler, Shifts in plant-microbe interactions over community succession and their effects on plant resistance to herbivores. *New Phytol.* **226**, 1144–1157 (2020).
4. F. I. Pugnaire, J. A. Morillo, J. Peñuelas, P. B. Reich, R. D. Bardgett, A. Gaxiola, D. A. Wardle, W. H. van der Putten, Climate change effects on plant-soil feedbacks and consequences for biodiversity and functioning of terrestrial ecosystems. *Sci. Adv.* **5**, eaaz1834 (2019).
5. E. Bergmann, J. Bender, H.-J. Weigel, Impact of tropospheric ozone on terrestrial biodiversity: A literature analysis to identify ozone sensitive taxa. *J. Appl. Bot. Food Qual.* **90**, 83–105 (2017).
6. D. Tarasick, I. E. Galbally, O. R. Cooper, M. G. Schultz, G. Ancellet, T. Leblanc, T. J. Wallington, J. Ziemke, X. Liu, M. Steinbacher, J. Staehelin, C. Vigouroux, J. W. Hannigan, O. García, G. Foret, P. Zanis, E. Weatherhead, I. Petropavlovskikh, H. Worden, M. Osman, J. Liu, K.-L. Chang, A. Gaudel, M. Lin, M. Granados-Muñoz, A. M. Thompson, S. J. Oltmans, J. Cuesta, G. Dufour, V. Thouret, B. Hassler, T. Trickl, J. L. Neu, Tropospheric Ozone Assessment Report: Tropospheric ozone from 1877 to 2016, observed levels, trends and uncertainties. *Elem. Sci. Anthr.* **7**, 39 (2019).
7. A. S. Lefohn, C. S. Malley, L. Smith, B. Wells, M. Hazucha, H. Simon, V. Naik, G. Mills, M. G. Schultz, E. Paoletti, A. De Marco, X. Xu, L. Zhang, T. Wang, H. S. Neufeld, R. C. Musselman, D. Tarasick, M. Brauer, Z. Feng, H. Tang, K. Kobayashi, P. Sicard, S. Solberg, G. Gerosa, Tropospheric ozone assessment report: Global ozone metrics for climate change, human health, and crop/ecosystem research. *Elem. Sci. Anth.* **6**, 28 (2018).
8. L. Y. Yeung, L. T. Murray, P. Martinerie, E. Witrant, H. Hu, A. Banerjee, A. Orsi, J. Chappellaz, Isotopic constraint on the twentieth-century increase in tropospheric ozone. *Nature* **570**, 224–227 (2019).
9. P. Sicard, A. Anav, A. De Marco, E. Paoletti, Projected global tropospheric ozone impacts on

- vegetation under different emission and climate scenarios. *Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss.* **17**, 12177–12196 (2017).
10. J. Fuhrer, M. Val Martin, G. Mills, C. L. Heald, H. Harmens, F. Hayes, K. Sharps, J. Bender, M. R. Ashmore, Current and future ozone risks to global terrestrial biodiversity and ecosystem processes. *Ecol. Evol.* **6**, 8785–8799 (2016).
  11. E. Agathokleous, R. G. Belz, V. Calatayud, A. De Marco, Y. Hoshika, M. Kitao, C. J. Saitanis, P. Sicard, E. Paoletti, E. J. Calabrese, Predicting the effect of ozone on vegetation via linear non-threshold (LNT), threshold and hormetic dose-response models. *Sci. Total Environ.* **649**, 61–74 (2019).
  12. P. Li, Z. Feng, V. Catalayud, X. Yuan, Y. Xu, E. Paoletti, A meta-analysis on growth, physiological, and biochemical responses of woody species to ground-level ozone highlights the role of plant functional types. *Plant Cell Environ.* **40**, 2369–2380 (2017).
  13. E. Agathokleous, C. J. Saitanis, X. Wang, M. Watanabe, T. Koike, A review study on past 40 years of research on effects of tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> on belowground structure, functioning, and processes of trees: A linkage with potential ecological implications. *Wat. Air Soil Pollut.* **227**, 33 (2016).
  14. S. Bassin, M. Volk, J. Fuhrer, Factors affecting the ozone sensitivity of temperate European grasslands: An overview. *Environ. Pollut.* **146**, 678–691 (2007).
  15. P. Li, V. Calatayud, F. Gao, J. Uddling, Z. Feng, Differences in ozone sensitivity among woody species are related to leaf morphology and antioxidant levels. *Tree Physiol.* **36**, 1105–1116 (2016).
  16. A. W. Davison, J. D. Barnes, Effects of ozone on wild plants. *New Phytol.* **139**, 135–151 (1998).
  17. E. Agathokleous, C. J. Saitanis, Plant susceptibility to ozone: A tower of babel? *Sci. Total Environ.* **703**, 134962 (2020).
  18. E. Oksanen, S. Manninen, E. Vapaavuori, T. Holopainen, Near-ambient ozone concentrations reduce the vigor of *Betula* and *Populus* species in Finland. *Ambio* **38**, 413–417 (2009).
  19. E. Häikiö, V. Freiwald, R. Julkunen-Tiitto, E. Beuker, T. Holopainen, E. Oksanen, Differences in leaf characteristics between ozone-sensitive and ozone-tolerant hybrid aspen (*Populus tremula* × *Populus tremuloides*) clones. *Tree Physiol.* **29**, 53–66 (2009).
  20. J. Dumont, S. Keski-Saari, M. Keinänen, D. Cohen, N. Ningre, S. Kontunen-Soppela, P.

- Baldet, Y. Gibon, P. Dizengremel, M.-N. Vaultier, Y. Jolivet, E. Oksanen, D. Le Thiec, Ozone affects ascorbate and glutathione biosynthesis as well as amino acid contents in three Euramerican poplar genotypes. *Tree Physiol.* **34**, 253–266 (2014).
21. S. Kontunen-Soppela, V. Ossipov, S. Ossipova, E. Oksanen, Shift in birch leaf metabolome and carbon allocation during long-term open-field ozone exposure. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **13**, 1053–1067 (2007).
  22. S. Kontunen-Soppela, J. Riikonen, H. Ruhanen, M. Brosché, P. Somervuo, P. Peltonen, J. Kangasjärvi, P. Auvinen, L. Paulin, M. Keinänen, E. Oksanen, E. Vapaavuori, Differential gene expression in senescing leaves of two silver birch genotypes in response to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and tropospheric ozone. *Plant Cell Environ.* **33**, 1016–1028 (2010).
  23. J. Riikonen, M. Mäenpää, M. Alavillamo, T. Silfver, E. Oksanen, Interactive effect of elevated temperature and O<sub>3</sub> on antioxidant capacity and gas exchange in *Betula pendula* saplings. *Planta* **230**, 419–427 (2009).
  24. M. Brosché, E. Merilo, F. Mayer, P. Pechter, I. Puzõrjova, G. Brader, J. Kangasjärvi, H. Kollist, Natural variation in ozone sensitivity among *Arabidopsis thaliana* accessions and its relation to stomatal conductance. *Plant Cell Environ.* **33**, 914–925 (2010).
  25. B. Grimmig, M. N. Gonzalez-Perez, G. Leubner-Metzger, R. Vögeli-Lange, F. Meins Jr., R. Hain, J. Penuelas, B. Heidenreich, C. Langebartels, D. Ernst, H. Sandermann Jr., Ozone-induced gene expression occurs via ethylene-dependent and -independent signalling. *Plant Mol. Biol.* **51**, 599–607 (2003).
  26. N. Suzuki, R. M. Rivero, V. Shulaev, E. Blumwald, R. Mittler, Abiotic and biotic stress combinations. *New Phytol.* **203**, 32–43 (2014).
  27. Z. Feng, B. Shang, Z. Li, V. Calatayud, E. Agathokleous, Ozone will remain a threat for plants independently of nitrogen load. *Funct. Ecol.* **33**, 1854–1870 (2019).
  28. E. Oksanen, J. Sober, D. F. Karnosky, Impacts of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and/or O<sub>3</sub> on leaf ultrastructure of aspen (*Populus tremuloides*) and birch (*Betula papyrifera*) in the aspen FACE experiment. *Environ. Pollut.* **115**, 437–446 (2001).
  29. Z. Feng, P. Büker, H. Pleijel, L. Emberson, P. E. Karlsson, J. Uddling, A unifying explanation for variation in ozone sensitivity among woody plants. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **24**, 78–84 (2018).
  30. P. E. Karlsson, S. Braun, M. Broadmeadow, S. Elvira, L. Emberson, B. S. Gimeno, D. Le

- Thiec, K. Novak, E. Oksanen, M. Schaub, J. Uddling, M. Wilkinson, Risk assessments for forest trees: The performance of the ozone flux versus the AOT concepts. *Environ. Pollut.* **146**, 608–616 (2007).
31. F. Bussotti, Functional leaf traits, plant communities and acclimation processes in relation to oxidative stress in trees: A critical overview. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **14**, 2727–2739 (2008).
32. G. Karabourniotis, G. Liakopoulos, D. Nikolopoulos, P. Bresta, Protective and defensive roles of non-glandular trichomes against multiple stresses: Structure-function coordination. *J. For. Res.* **31**, 1–12 (2019).
33. F. Hayes, G. Mills, H. Harmens, K. Wyness, Within season and carry-over effects following exposure of grassland species mixtures to increasing background ozone. *Environ. Pollut.* **159**, 2420–2426 (2011).
34. A. De Marco, M. Vitale, I. Popa, A. Anav, O. Badea, D. Silaghi, S. Leca, A. Screpanti, E. Paoletti, Ozone exposure affects tree defoliation in a continental climate. *Sci. Total Environ.* **596–597**, 396–404 (2017).
35. P. Sicard, A. De Marco, L. Dalstein-Richier, F. Tagliaferro, C. Renou, E. Paoletti, An epidemiological assessment of stomatal ozone flux-based critical levels for visible ozone injury in Southern European forests. *Sci. Total Environ.* **541**, 729–741 (2016).
36. Z. Feng, J. Sun, W. Wan, E. Hu, V. Calatayud, Evidence of widespread ozone-induced visible injury on plants in Beijing, China. *Environ. Pollut.* **193**, 296–301 (2014).
37. E. Paoletti, A. Alivernini, A. Anav, O. Badea, E. Carrari, S. Chivulescu, A. Conte, M. L. Ciriani, L. Dalstein-Richier, A. De Marco, S. Fares, G. Fasano, A. Giovannelli, M. Lazzara, S. Leca, A. Materassi, V. Moretti, D. Pitar, I. Popa, F. Sabatini, L. Salvati, P. Sicard, T. Sorgi, Y. Hoshika, Toward stomatal flux-based forest protection against ozone: The MOTTLES approach. *Sci. Total Environ.* **691**, 516–527 (2019).
38. R. Marzuoli, G. Gerosa, F. Bussotti, M. Pollastrini, Assessing the impact of ozone on forest trees in an integrative perspective: Are foliar visible symptoms suitable predictors for growth reduction? A critical review. *Forests* **10**, 1144 (2019).
39. C. J. Saitanis, E. Agathokleous, Stress response and population dynamics: Is Allee effect hormesis? *Sci. Total Environ.* **682**, 623–628 (2019).
40. F. Scebba, F. Canaccini, A. Castagna, J. Bender, H.-J. Weigel, A. Ranieri, Physiological and biochemical stress responses in grassland species are influenced by both early-season ozone

- exposure and interspecific competition. *Environ. Pollut.* **142**, 540–548 (2006).
41. K. V. Wedlich, N. Rintoul, S. Peacock, J. N. Cape, M. Coyle, S. Toet, J. Barnes, M. Ashmore, Effects of ozone on species composition in an upland grassland. *Oecologia* **168**, 1137–1146 (2012).
  42. H. Calvete-Sogo, I. González-Fernández, J. Sanz, S. Elvira, R. Alonso, H. García-Gómez, M. A. Ibáñez-Ruiz, V. Bermejo-Bermejo, Heterogeneous responses to ozone and nitrogen alter the species composition of Mediterranean annual pastures. *Oecologia* **181**, 1055–1067 (2016).
  43. F. Hayes, M. L. M. Jones, G. Mills, M. Ashmore, Meta-analysis of the relative sensitivity of semi-natural vegetation species to ozone. *Environ. Pollut.* **146**, 754–762 (2007).
  44. M. L. M. Jones, F. Hayes, G. Mills, T. H. Sparks, J. Fuhrer, Predicting community sensitivity to ozone, using Ellenberg Indicator values. *Environ. Pollut.* **146**, 744–753 (2007).
  45. F. Hayes, J. Williamson, G. Mills, Ozone pollution affects flower numbers and timing in a simulated BAP priority calcareous grassland community. *Environ. Pollut.* **163**, 40–47 (2012).
  46. F. Hayes, G. Mills, P. Williams, H. Harmens, P. Büker, Impacts of summer ozone exposure on the growth and overwintering of UK upland vegetation. *Atmos. Environ.* **40**, 4088–4097 (2006).
  47. M. R. Ashmore, R. H. Thwaites, N. Ainsworth, D. A. Cousins, S. A. Power, A. J. Morton, Effects of ozone on calcareous grassland communities. *Wat. Air Soil Pollut.* **85**, 1527–1532 (1995).
  48. M. R. Ashmore, N. Ainsworth, The Effects of ozone and cutting on the species composition of artificial grassland communities. *Funct. Ecol.* **9**, 708–712 (1995).
  49. D. N. Barbo, A. H. Chappelka, G. L. Somers, M. S. Miller-Goodman, K. Stolte, Diversity of an early successional plant community as influenced by ozone. *New Phytol.* **138**, 653–662 (1998).
  50. M. A. Martínez-Ghersa, A. I. Menéndez, P. E. Gundel, A. M. Folcia, A. M. Romero, J. B. Landesmann, L. Ventura, C. M. Ghersa, Legacy of historic ozone exposure on plant community and food web structure. *PLOS ONE*. **12**, e0182796 (2017).
  51. R. H. Thwaites, M. R. Ashmore, A. J. Morton, R. J. Pakeman, The effects of tropospheric ozone on the species dynamics of calcareous grassland. *Environ. Pollut.* **144**, 500–509 (2006).



52. S. Bassin, M. Volk, J. Fuhrer, Species composition of subalpine grassland is sensitive to nitrogen deposition, but not to ozone, after seven years of treatment. *Ecosystems* **16**, 1105–1117 (2013).
53. R. J. Payne, C. J. Stevens, N. B. Dise, D. J. Gowing, M. G. Pilkington, G. K. Phoenix, B. A. Emmett, M. R. Ashmore, Impacts of atmospheric pollution on the plant communities of British acid grasslands. *Environ. Pollut.* **159**, 2602–2608 (2011).
54. J. Fuhrer, Effects of ozone on managed pasture: I. Effects of open-top chambers on microclimate, ozone flux, and plant growth. *Environ. Pollut.* **86**, 297–305 (1994).
55. J. Fuhrer, H. Shariat-Madari, R. Perler, W. Tschannen, A. Grub, Effects of ozone on managed pasture: II. Yield, species composition, canopy structure, and forage quality. *Environ. Pollut.* **86**, 307–314 (1994).
56. S. Wilbourn, A. W. Davison, J. H. Ollerenshaw, The use of an unenclosed field fumigation system to determine the effects of elevated ozone on a grass–clover mixture. *New Phytol.* **129**, 23–32 (1995).
57. F. Hayes, G. Mills, M. Ashmore, Effects of ozone on inter- and intra-species competition and photosynthesis in mesocosms of *Lolium perenne* and *Trifolium repens*. *Environ. Pollut.* **157**, 208–214 (2009).
58. S. Nussbaum, M. Geissmann, J. Fuhrer, Ozone exposure-response relationships for mixtures of perennial ryegrass and white clover depend on ozone exposure patterns. *Atmos. Environ.* **29**, 989–995 (1995).
59. A. S. Heagle, J. Rebbeck, S. R. Shafer, U. Blum, W. W. Heck, Effects of long-term ozone exposure and soil moisture deficit on growth of a ladino clover-tall fescue pasture. *Phytopathology* **79**, 128–136 (1989).
60. F. Hayes, G. Mills, L. Jones, J. Abbott, M. Ashmore, J. Barnes, J. Neil Cape, M. Coyle, S. Peacock, N. Rintoul, S. Toet, K. Wedlich, K. Wyness, Consistent ozone-induced decreases in pasture forage quality across several grassland types and consequences for UK lamb production. *Sci. Total Environ.* **543**, 336–346 (2016).
61. L. Granlund, S. Keski-Saari, T. Kumpula, E. Oksanen, M. Keinänen, Imaging lichen water content with visible to mid-wave infrared (400–5500 nm) spectroscopy. *Remote Sens. Environ.* **216**, 301–310 (2018).
62. S. Nussbaum, P. Bungener, M. Geissmann, J. Fuhrer, Plant-plant interactions and soil

- moisture might be important in determining ozone impacts on grasslands. *New Phytol.* **147**, 327–335 (2000).
63. S. Bassin, M. Volk, M. Suter, N. Buchmann, J. Fuhrer, Nitrogen deposition but not ozone affects productivity and community composition of subalpine grassland after 3 yr of treatment. *New Phytol.* **175**, 523–534 (2007).
  64. A. Stampfli, J. Fuhrer, Spatial heterogeneity confounded ozone-exposure experiment in semi-natural grassland. *Oecologia* **162**, 515–522 (2010).
  65. E. Agathokleous, Y. WaiLi, G. Ntatsi, K. Konno, C. J. Saitanis, M. Kitao, T. Koike, Effects of ozone and ammonium sulfate on cauliflower: Emphasis on the interaction between plants and insect herbivores. *Sci. Total Environ.* **659**, 995–1007 (2019).
  66. M. Frei, Lignin: Characterization of a multifaceted crop component. *ScientificWorldJournal* **2013**, 436517 (2013).
  67. R. Karban, The ecology and evolution of induced resistance against herbivores. *Funct. Ecol.* **25**, 339–347 (2011).
  68. G. K. Taggar, R. S. Gill, A. K. Gupta, J. S. Sandhu, Fluctuations in peroxidase and catalase activities of resistant and susceptible black gram (*Vigna mungo* (L.) Hepper) genotypes elicited by *Bemisia tabaci* (Gennadius) feeding. *Plant Signal. Behav.* **7**, 1321–1329 (2012).
  69. A. R. War, M. G. Paulraj, B. Hussain, A. A. Buhroo, S. Ignacimuthu, H. C. Sharma, Effect of plant secondary metabolites on *Helicoverpa armigera*. *J. Pest Sci.* **86**, 399–408 (2013).
  70. A. M. Trowbridge, in *Ecology and the Environment*, R. K. Monson, Ed. (Springer, 2015), pp. 1–28.
  71. R. Kaur, A. K. Gupta, G. K. Taggar, Induced resistance by oxidative shifts in pigeonpea (*Cajanus cajan* L.) following *Helicoverpa armigera* (Hübner) herbivory. *Pest Manag. Sci.* **71**, 770–782 (2015).
  72. M. Wink, Plant secondary metabolites modulate insect behavior—steps toward addiction? *Front. Physiol.* **9**, 364 (2018).
  73. R. L. Lindroth, Impacts of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> on forests: Phytochemistry, trophic interactions, and ecosystem dynamics. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **36**, 2–21 (2010).
  74. E. Agathokleous, T. Sakikawa, S. A. Abu ElEla, T. Mochizuki, M. Nakamura, M. Watanabe, K. Kawamura, T. Koike, Ozone alters the feeding behavior of the leaf beetle *Agelastica coerulea* (Coleoptera: Chrysomelidae) into leaves of Japanese white birch (*Betula*

- platyphylla* var. *japonica*). *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **24**, 17577–17583 (2017).
75. E. Valkama, J. Koricheva, E. Oksanen, Effects of elevated O<sub>3</sub>, alone and in combination with elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, on tree leaf chemistry and insect herbivore performance: A meta-analysis. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **13**, 184–201 (2007).
76. R. L. Lindroth, B. J. Kopper, W. F. Parsons, J. G. Bockheim, D. F. Karnosky, G. R. Hendrey, K. S. Pregitzer, J. G. Isebrands, J. Sober, Consequences of elevated carbon dioxide and ozone for foliar chemical composition and dynamics in trembling aspen (*Populus tremuloides*) and paper birch (*Betula papyrifera*). *Environ. Pollut.* **115**, 395–404 (2001).
77. J. J. Couture, T. D. Meehan, K. F. Rubert-Nason, R. L. Lindroth, Effects of elevated atmospheric carbon dioxide and tropospheric ozone on phytochemical composition of trembling aspen (*Populus tremuloides*) and paper birch (*Betula papyrifera*). *J. Chem. Ecol.* **43**, 26–38 (2017).
78. K. Konno, Plant latex and other exudates as plant defense systems: Roles of various defense chemicals and proteins contained therein. *Phytochemistry* **72**, 1510–1530 (2011).
79. G.-I. Arimura, K. Matsui, J. Takabayashi, Chemical and molecular ecology of herbivore-induced plant volatiles: Proximate factors and their ultimate functions. *Plant Cell Physiol.* **50**, 911–923 (2009).
80. A. R. War, M. G. Paulraj, T. Ahmad, A. A. Buhroo, B. Hussain, S. Ignacimuthu, H. C. Sharma, Mechanisms of plant defense against insect herbivores. *Plant Signal. Behav.* **7**, 1306–1320 (2012).
81. J. J. Couture, R. L. Lindroth, Atmospheric change alters performance of an invasive forest insect. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **18**, 3543–3557 (2012).
82. E. Khaling, S. Papazian, E. H. Poelman, J. K. Holopainen, B. R. Albrechtsen, J. D. Blande, Ozone affects growth and development of *Pieris brassicae* on the wild host plant *Brassica nigra*. *Environ. Pollut.* **199**, 119–129 (2015).
83. T. Cornelissen, Climate change and its effects on terrestrial insects and herbivory patterns. *Neotrop. Entomol.* **40**, 155–163 (2011).
84. J. G. Ali, A. A. Agrawal, Specialist versus generalist insect herbivores and plant defense. *Trends Plant Sci.* **17**, 293–302 (2012).
85. H. Cui, J. Su, J. Wei, Y. Hu, F. Ge, Elevated O<sub>3</sub> enhances the attraction of whitefly-infested tomato plants to *Encarsia formosa*. *Sci. Rep.* **4**, 5350 (2014).

86. T. Sugai, S. Okamoto, E. Agathokleous, N. Masui, F. Satoh, T. Koike, Leaf defense capacity of Japanese elm (*Ulmus davidiana* var. *japonica*) seedlings subjected to a nitrogen loading and insect herbivore dynamics in a free air ozone-enriched environment. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **27**, 3350–3360 (2020).
87. S. A. Abu ElEla, E. Agathokleous, T. Koike, Growth and nutrition of *Agelastica coerulea* (Coleoptera: Chrysomelidae) larvae changed when fed with leaves obtained from an O<sub>3</sub>-enriched atmosphere. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **25**, 13186–13194 (2018).
88. S. A. Abu ElEla, E. Agathokleous, N. A. Ghazawy, T. R. Amin, W. M. ElSayed, T. Koike, Enzyme activity modification in adult beetles (*Agelastica coerulea*) inhabiting birch trees in an ozone-enriched atmosphere. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **25**, 32675–32683 (2018).
89. N. Masui, T. Mochizuki, A. Tani, H. Matsuura, E. Agathokleous, T. Watanabe, T. Koike, Does ozone alter the attractiveness of Japanese white birch leaves to the leaf beetle *Agelastica coerulea* via changes in biogenic volatile organic compounds (BVOCs): An examination with the Y-tube test. *Forests* **11**, 58 (2020).
90. M. A. Jamieson, L. A. Burkle, J. S. Manson, J. B. Runyon, A. M. Trowbridge, J. Zientek, Global change effects on plant–insect interactions: The role of phytochemistry. *Curr. Opin. Insect Sci.* **23**, 70–80 (2017).
91. Q. S. McFrederick, J. D. Fuentes, T. Roulston, J. C. Kathilankal, M. Ler dau, Effects of air pollution on biogenic volatiles and ecological interactions. *Oecologia* **160**, 411–420 (2009).
92. P. Y. Oikawa, M. T. Ler dau, Catabolism of volatile organic compounds influences plant survival. *Trends Plant Sci.* **18**, 695–703 (2013).
93. S. Dötterl, M. Vater, T. Rupp, A. Held, Ozone differentially affects perception of plant volatiles in western honey bees. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **42**, 486–489 (2016).
94. S. Dötterl, N. J. Vereecken, The chemical ecology and evolution of bee-flower interactions: A review and perspectives. *Can. J. Zool.* **88**, 668–697 (2010).
95. J. Peñuelas, D. Asensio, D. Tholl, K. Wenke, M. Rosenkranz, B. Piechulla, J. P. Schnitzler, Biogenic volatile emissions from the soil. *Plant Cell Environ.* **37**, 1866–1891 (2014).
96. M. Heil, Herbivore-induced plant volatiles: Targets, perception and unanswered questions. *New Phytol.* **204**, 297–306 (2014).
97. A. Guenther, Biological and chemical diversity of biogenic volatile organic emissions into the atmosphere. *ISRN Atmos. Sci.* **2013**, 786290 (2013).

98. E. Agathokleous, M. Kitao, E. J. Calabrese, Emission of volatile organic compounds from plants shows a biphasic pattern within an hormetic context. *Environ. Pollut.* **239**, 318–321 (2018).
99. C. Calfapietra, E. Pallozzi, I. Lusini, V. Velikova, in *Biology, Controls and Models of Tree Volatile Organic Compound Emissions*, Ü. Niinemets, R. K. Monson, Eds. (Springer, 2013), pp. 253–284.
100. J. Llusà, J. Peñuelas, B. S. Gimeno, Seasonal and species-specific Mediterranean plant VOC emissions by Mediterranean woody plant to elevated ozone concentrations. *Atmos. Environ.* **36**, 3931–3938 (2002).
101. Z. Feng, X. Yuan, S. Fares, F. Loreto, P. Li, Y. Hoshika, E. Paoletti, Isoprene is more affected by climate drivers than monoterpenes: A meta-analytic review on plant isoprenoid emissions. *Plant Cell Environ.* **42**, 1939–1949 (2019).
102. P. S. Giron-Calva, T. Li, J. D. Blande, Volatile-mediated interactions between cabbage plants in the field and the impact of ozone pollution. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **43**, 339–350 (2017).
103. Q. S. McFrederick, J. C. Kathilankal, J. D. Fuentes, Air pollution modifies floral scent trails. *Atmos. Environ.* **42**, 2336–2348 (2008).
104. D. M. Pinto, J. D. Blande, S. R. Souza, A.-M. Nerg, J. K. Holopainen, Plant volatile organic compounds (VOCs) in ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) polluted atmospheres: The ecological effects. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **36**, 22–34 (2010).
105. T. Li, J. D. Blande, Associational susceptibility in broccoli: Mediated by plant volatiles, impeded by ozone. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **21**, 1993–2004 (2015).
106. J. D. Fuentes, T. H. Roulston, J. Zenker, Ozone impedes the ability of a herbivore to find its host. *Environ. Res. Lett.* **8**, 014048 (2013).
107. G. Farré-Armengol, J. Peñuelas, T. Li, P. Yli-Pirilä, I. Filella, J. Llusia, J. D. Blande, Ozone degrades floral scent and reduces pollinator attraction to flowers. *New Phytol.* **209**, 152–160 (2016).
108. R. D. Girling, I. Lusebrink, E. Farthing, T. A. Newman, G. M. Poppy, Diesel exhaust rapidly degrades floral odours used by honeybees. *Sci. Rep.* **3**, 2779 (2013).
109. D. M. Pinto, J. D. Blande, R. Nykänen, W.-X. Dong, A.-M. Nerg, J. K. Holopainen, Ozone degrades common herbivore-induced plant volatiles: Does this affect herbivore prey location by predators and parasitoids? *J. Chem. Ecol.* **33**, 683–694 (2007).

110. S. J. Himanen, A.-M. Nerg, A. Nissinen, D. M. Pinto, C. N. Stewart Jr., G. M. Poppy, J. K. Holopainen, Effects of elevated carbon dioxide and ozone on volatile terpenoid emissions and multitrophic communication of transgenic insecticidal oilseed rape (*Brassica napus*). *New Phytol.* **181**, 174–186 (2009).
111. E. Khaling, T. Li, J. K. Holopainen, J. D. Blande, Elevated ozone modulates herbivore-induced volatile emissions of *Brassica nigra* and alters a tritrophic interaction. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **42**, 368–381 (2016).
112. B. J. Kopper, R. L. Lindroth, Effects of elevated carbon dioxide and ozone on the phytochemistry of aspen and performance of an herbivore. *Oecologia* **134**, 95–103 (2003).
113. P. S. Girón-Calva, T. Li, J. D. Blande, Plant–plant interactions affect the susceptibility of plants to oviposition by pests but are disrupted by ozone pollution. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **233**, 352–360 (2016).
114. C. S. Awmack, R. Harrington, R. L. Lindroth, Aphid individual performance may not predict population responses to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> or O<sub>3</sub>. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **10**, 1414–1423 (2004).
115. M. L. Hillstrom, R. L. Lindroth, Elevated atmospheric carbon dioxide and ozone alter forest insect abundance and community composition. *Insect Conserv. Divers.* **1**, 233–241 (2008).
116. M. L. Hillstrom, J. J. Couture, R. L. Lindroth, Elevated carbon dioxide and ozone have weak, idiosyncratic effects on herbivorous forest insect abundance, species richness, and community composition. *Insect Conserv. Divers.* **7**, 553–562 (2014).
117. S. Compant, C. Clément, A. Sessitsch, Plant growth-promoting bacteria in the rhizo- and endosphere of plants: Their role, colonization, mechanisms involved and prospects for utilization. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **42**, 669–678 (2010).
118. P. R. Hardoim, L. S. van Overbeek, G. Berg, A. M. Pirttilä, S. Compant, A. Campisano, M. Döring, A. Sessitsch, The hidden world within plants: Ecological and evolutionary considerations for defining functioning of microbial endophytes. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* **79**, 293–320 (2015).
119. F. Bringel, I. Couée, Pivotal roles of phyllosphere microorganisms at the interface between plant functioning and atmospheric trace gas dynamics. *Front. Microbiol.* **6**, 486 (2015).
120. V. Imperato, L. Kowalkowski, M. Portillo-Estrada, S. W. Gawronski, J. Vangronsveld, S. Thijs, Characterisation of the *Carpinus betulus* L. phyllosphere microbiome in urban and forest

- areas. *Front. Microbiol.* **10**, 1110 (2019).
121. M. Wenig, A. Ghirardo, J. H. Sales, E. S. Pabst, H. H. Breitenbach, F. Antritter, B. Weber, B. Lange, M. Lenk, R. K. Cameron, J.-P. Schnitzler, A. C. Vlot, Systemic acquired resistance networks amplify airborne defense cues. *Nat. Commun.* **10**, 3813 (2019).
122. M. A. Hassani, P. Durán, S. Hacquard, Microbial interactions within the plant holobiont. *Microbiome.* **6**, 58 (2018).
123. P. Fincheira, A. Quiroz, Microbial volatiles as plant growth inducers. *Microbiol. Res.* **208**, 63–75 (2018).
124. L. Philippot, J. M. Raaijmakers, P. Lemanceau, W. H. van der Putten, Going back to the roots: The microbial ecology of the rhizosphere. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* **11**, 789–799 (2013).
125. P. Vandenkoornhuyse, A. Quaiser, M. Duhamel, A. Le Van, A. Dufresne, The importance of the microbiome of the plant holobiont. *New Phytol.* **206**, 1196–1206 (2015).
126. F. Changey, M. Bagard, M. Souleymane, T. Z. Lerch, Cascading effects of elevated ozone on wheat rhizosphere microbial communities depend on temperature and cultivar sensitivity. *Environ. Pollut.* **242**, 113–125 (2018).
127. Z. Chen, M. R. Maltz, J. Cao, H. Yu, H. Shang, E. Aronson, Elevated O<sub>3</sub> alters soil bacterial and fungal communities and the dynamics of carbon and nitrogen. *Sci. Total Environ.* **677**, 272–280 (2019).
128. J. Dunbar, L. V. Gallegos-Graves, B. Steven, R. Mueller, C. Hesse, D. R. Zak, C. R. Kuske, Surface soil fungal and bacterial communities in aspen stands are resilient to eleven years of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **76**, 227–234 (2014).
129. Z. He, J. Xiong, A. D. Kent, Y. Deng, K. Xue, G. Wang, L. Wu, J. D. Van Nostrand, J. Zhou, Distinct responses of soil microbial communities to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> in a soybean agro-ecosystem. *ISME J.* **8**, 714–726 (2014).
130. J. Zhang, H. Tang, J. Zhu, X. Lin, Y. Feng, Effects of elevated ground-level ozone on paddy soil bacterial community and assembly mechanisms across four years. *Sci. Total Environ.* **654**, 505–513 (2019).
131. P. Wang, E. L. Marsh, E. A. Ainsworth, A. D. B. Leakey, A. M. Sheflin, D. P. Schachtman, Shifts in microbial communities in soil, rhizosphere and roots of two major crop systems under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, 15019 (2017).
132. J. Wang, F. Hayes, R. Turner, D. R. Chadwick, G. Mills, D. L. Jones, Effects of four years

- of elevated ozone on microbial biomass and extracellular enzyme activities in a semi-natural grassland. *Sci. Total Environ.* **660**, 260–268 (2019).
133. D. A. Grantz, S. Gunn, H.-B. Vu, O<sub>3</sub> impacts on plant development: A meta-analysis of root/shoot allocation and growth. *Plant Cell Environ.* **29**, 1193–1209 (2006).
134. N. Akhtar, M. Yamaguchi, H. Inada, D. Hoshino, T. Kondo, M. Fukami, R. Funada, T. Izuta, Effects of ozone on growth, yield and leaf gas exchange rates of four Bangladeshi cultivars of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Environ. Pollut.* **158**, 2970–2976 (2010).
135. H. Tang, G. Liu, J. Zhu, K. Kobayashi, Effects of elevated ozone concentration on CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O emission from paddy soil under fully open-air field conditions. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **21**, 1727–1736 (2015).
136. A. M. Betzelberger, K. M. Gillespie, J. M. Mcgrath, R. P. Koester, R. L. Nelson, E. A. Ainsworth, Effects of chronic elevated ozone concentration on antioxidant capacity, photosynthesis and seed yield of 10 soybean cultivars. *Plant Cell Environ.* **33**, 1569–1581 (2010).
137. D. Simpson, A. Arneth, G. Mills, S. Solberg, J. Uddling, Ozone — The persistent menace: Interactions with the N cycle and climate change. *Curr. Opin. Environ. Sustain.* **9–10**, 9–19 (2014).
138. M. Vitale, W. Amitrano, Y. Hoshika, E. Paoletti, Plant species-specific litter decomposition rates are directly affected by tropospheric ozone: Analysis of trends and modelling. *Wat. Air, Soil Pollut.* **230**, 311 (2019).
139. H. Wu, Q. Li, C. Lu, L. Zhang, J. Zhu, F. A. Dijkstra, Q. Yu, Elevated ozone effects on soil nitrogen cycling differ among wheat cultivars. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* **108**, 187–194 (2016).
140. H. Rennenberg, M. Dannenmann, A. Gessler, J. Kreuzwieser, J. Simon, H. Papen, Nitrogen balance in forest soils: Nutritional limitation of plants under climate change stresses. *Plant Biol.* **11**, 4–23 (2009).
141. B. Gielen, M. Löw, G. Deckmyn, U. Metzger, F. Franck, C. Heerdt, R. Matyssek, R. Valcke, R. Ceulemans, Chronic ozone exposure affects leaf senescence of adult beech trees: A chlorophyll fluorescence approach. *J. Exp. Bot.* **58**, 785–795 (2007).
142. Z. Feng, S. Wang, Z. Szantoi, S. Chen, X. Wang, Protection of plants from ambient ozone by applications of ethylenediurea (EDU): A meta-analytic review. *Environ. Pollut.* **158**, 3236–3242 (2010).



143. A. Kasurinen, P. A. Peltonen, R. Julkunen-Tiitto, E. Vapaavuori, V. Nuutinen, T. Holopainen, J. K. Holopainen, Effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> on leaf litter phenolics and subsequent performance of litter-feeding soil macrofauna. *Plant Soil* **292**, 25–43 (2007).
144. E. Agathokleous, M. Kitao, C. Qingnan, C. J. Saitanis, E. Paoletti, W. J. Manning, T. Watanabe, T. Koike, Effects of ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) and ethylenediurea (EDU) on the ecological stoichiometry of a willow grown in a free-air exposure system. *Environ. Pollut.* **238**, 663–676 (2018).
145. C. Shi, T. Watanabe, T. Koike, Leaf stoichiometry of deciduous tree species in different soils exposed to free-air O<sub>3</sub> enrichment over two growing seasons. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* **138**, 148–163 (2017).
146. N. T. Edwards, Root and soil respiration responses to ozone in *Pinus taeda* L. seedlings. *New Phytol.* **118**, 315–321 (1991).
147. J. K. McCrady, C. P. Andersen, The effect of ozone on below-ground carbon allocation in wheat. *Environ. Pollut.* **107**, 465–472 (2000).
148. W. F. J. Parsons, J. G. Bockheim, R. L. Lindroth, Independent, interactive, and species-specific responses of leaf litter decomposition to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> in a northern hardwood forest. *Ecosystems* **11**, 505–519 (2008).
149. X. Li, Y. Deng, Q. Li, C. Lu, J. Wang, H. Zhang, J. Zhu, J. Zhou, Z. He, Shifts of functional gene representation in wheat rhizosphere microbial communities under elevated ozone. *ISME J.* **7**, 660–671 (2013).
150. T. Dolker, A. Mukherjee, S. B. Agrawal, M. Agrawal, Responses of a semi-natural grassland community of tropical region to elevated ozone: An assessment of soil dynamics and biomass accumulation. *Sci. Total Environ.* **718**, 137141 (2020).
151. J. L. Larson, D. R. Zak, R. L. Sinsabaugh, Extracellular enzyme activity beneath temperate trees growing under elevated carbon dioxide and ozone. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* **66**, 1848–1856 (2002).
152. Y. Feng, X. Lin, Y. Yu, H. Zhang, H. Chu, J. Zhu, Elevated ground-level O<sub>3</sub> negatively influences paddy methanogenic archaeal community. *Sci. Rep.* **3**, 3193 (2013).
153. C. Decock, J. Six, Effects of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> on N-cycling and N<sub>2</sub>O emissions: A short-term laboratory assessment. *Plant Soil* **351**, 277–292 (2012).
154. W. E. Holmes, D. R. Zak, K. S. Pregitzer, J. S. King, Soil nitrogen transformations under

- Populus tremuloides*, *Betula papyrifera* and *Acer saccharum* following 3 years exposure to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **9**, 1743–1750 (2003).
155. W. E. Holmes, D. R. Zak, K. S. Pregitzer, J. S. King, Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> alter soil nitrogen transformations beneath trembling aspen, paper birch, and sugar maple. *Ecosystems* **9**, 1354–1363 (2006).
156. T. Kanerva, A. Palojärvi, K. Rämö, K. Ojanperä, M. Esala, S. Manninen, A 3-year exposure to CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> induced minor changes in soil N cycling in a meadow ecosystem. *Plant Soil* **286**, 61–73 (2006).
157. E. I. Pujol Pereira, H. Chung, K. Scow, M. J. Sadowsky, C. Van Kessel, J. Six, Soil nitrogen transformations under elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> during the soybean growing season. *Environ. Pollut.* **159**, 401–407 (2011).
158. D. K. L. Hewitt, G. Mills, F. Hayes, S. Wilkinson, W. Davies, Highlighting the threat from current and near-future ozone pollution to clover in pasture. *Environ. Pollut.* **189**, 111–117 (2014).
159. T. Kanerva, K. Regina, K. Rämö, K. Ojanperä, S. Manninen, Fluxes of N<sub>2</sub>O, CH<sub>4</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> in a meadow ecosystem exposed to elevated ozone and carbon dioxide for three years. *Environ. Pollut.* **145**, 818–828 (2007).
160. Y. Qiu, Y. Jiang, L. Guo, K. O. Burkey, R. W. Zobel, H. D. Shew, S. Hu, Contrasting warming and ozone effects on denitrifiers dominate soil N<sub>2</sub>O emissions. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **52**, 10956–10966 (2018).
161. A. Bhatia, A. Ghosh, V. Kumar, R. Tomer, S. D. Singh, H. Pathak, Effect of elevated tropospheric ozone on methane and nitrous oxide emission from rice soil in north India. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **144**, 21–28 (2011).
162. T. J. Kou, X. H. Cheng, J. G. Zhu, Z. B. Xie, The influence of ozone pollution on CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, and N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from a Chinese subtropical rice–wheat rotation system under free-air O<sub>3</sub> exposure. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **204**, 72–81 (2015).
163. T. Kou, X. Hang, S. K. Lam, D. Chen, J. He, Ozone pollution increases CO<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O emissions in ozone-sensitive wheat system. *Agron. J.* **110**, 496–502 (2018).
164. X. Bao, J. Yu, W. Liang, C. Lu, J. Zhu, Q. Li, The interactive effects of elevated ozone and wheat cultivars on soil microbial community composition and metabolic diversity. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* **87**, 11–18 (2015).

165. T. Kanerva, A. Palojärvi, K. Rämö, S. Manninen, Changes in soil microbial community structure under elevated tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub>. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **40**, 2502–2510 (2008).
166. R. L. Phillips, D. R. Zak, W. E. Holmes, D. C. White, Microbial community composition and function beneath temperate trees exposed to elevated atmospheric carbon dioxide and ozone. *Oecologia* **131**, 236–244 (2002).
167. S. K. Mörsky, J. K. Haapala, R. Rinnan, P. Tiiva, S. Saarnio, J. Silvola, T. Holopainen, P. J. Martikainen, Long-term ozone effects on vegetation, microbial community and methane dynamics of boreal peatland microcosms in open-field conditions. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **14**, 1891–1903 (2008).
168. P. S. Nikolova, C. P. Andersen, H. Blaschke, R. Matyssek, K.-H. Häberle, Belowground effects of enhanced tropospheric ozone and drought in a beech/spruce forest (*Fagus sylvatica* L./*Picea abies* [L.] Karst). *Environ. Pollut.* **158**, 1071–1078 (2010).
169. Y. Ueda, K. Frindte, C. Knief, M. D. Ashrafuzzaman, M. Frei, Effects of elevated tropospheric ozone concentration on the bacterial community in the phyllosphere and rhizoplane of rice. *PLOS ONE*. **11**, e016317 (2016).
170. A. Kasurinen, M. M. Keinänen, S. Kaipainen, L.-O. Nilsson, E. Vapaavuori, M. H. Kontro, T. Holopainen, Below-ground responses of silver birch trees exposed to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> levels during three growing seasons. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **11**, 1167–1179 (2005).
171. T. Mrak, I. Štraus, T. Grebenc, J. Gričar, Y. Hoshika, G. Carriero, E. Paoletti, H. Kraigher, Different belowground responses to elevated ozone and soil water deficit in three European oak species (*Quercus ilex*, *Q. pubescens* and *Q. robur*). *Sci. Total Environ.* **651**, 1310–1320 (2019).
172. J. M. Fraterrigo, T. C. Balser, M. G. Turner, Microbial community variation and its relationship with nitrogen mineralization in historically altered forests. *Ecology* **87**, 570–579 (2006).
173. T. Rudrappa, K. J. Czymmek, P. W. Paré, H. P. Bais, Root-secreted malic acid recruits beneficial soil bacteria. *Plant Physiol.* **148**, 1547–1556 (2008).
174. J. Sasse, E. Martinoia, T. Northen, Feed your friends: Do plant exudates shape the root microbiome? *Trends Plant Sci.* **23**, 25–41 (2018).
175. M. Szoboszlay, A. White-Monsant, L. A. Moe, The effect of root exudate 7,4'-dihydroxyflavone and naringenin on soil bacterial community structure. *PLOS ONE*. **11**,

e0146555 (2016).

176. C. Preece, J. Peñuelas, A return to the wild: Root exudates and food security. *Trends Plant Sci.* **25**, 14–21 (2020).
177. C. Preece, G. Farré-Armengol, J. Llusià, J. Peñuelas, Thirsty tree roots exude more carbon. *Tree Physiol.* **38**, 690–695 (2018).
178. C. Preece, J. Peñuelas, Rhizodeposition under drought and consequences for soil communities and ecosystem resilience. *Plant Soil* **409**, 1–17 (2016).
179. Z. Chen, X. Wang, Z. Feng, Q. Xiao, X. Duan, Impact of elevated O<sub>3</sub> on soil microbial community function under wheat crop. *Wat. Air. Soil Pollut.* **198**, 189–198 (2009).
180. Z. Chen, X.-k. Wang, F.-x. Yao, Z.-z. Zheng, Z. Feng, Elevated ozone changed soil microbial community in a rice paddy. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* **74**, 829–837 (2010).
181. A. B. Dohrmann, C. C. Tebbe, Effect of elevated tropospheric ozone on the structure of bacterial communities inhabiting the rhizosphere of herbaceous plants native to Germany. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **71**, 7750–7758 (2005).
182. X. Wang, L. Qu, Q. Mao, M. Watanabe, Y. Hoshika, A. Koyama, K. Kawaguchi, Y. Tamai, T. Koike, Ectomycorrhizal colonization and growth of the hybrid larch F<sub>1</sub> under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub>. *Environ. Pollut.* **197**, 116–126 (2015).
183. Y. Feng, Y. Yu, H. Tang, Q. Zu, J. Zhu, X. Lin, The contrasting responses of soil microorganisms in two rice cultivars to elevated ground-level ozone. *Environ. Pollut.* **197**, 195–202 (2015).
184. Q. Li, Y. Yang, X. Bao, F. Liu, W. Liang, J. Zhu, T. M. Bezemer, W. H. van der Putten, Legacy effects of elevated ozone on soil biota and plant growth. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* **91**, 50–57 (2015).
185. J. Liang, T. W. Crowther, N. Picard, S. Wiser, M. Zhou, G. Alberti, E.-D. Schulze, A. D. McGuire, F. Bozzato, H. Pretzsch, S. de-Miguel, A. Paquette, B. Hérault, M. Scherer-Lorenzen, C. B. Barrett, H. B. Glick, G. M. Hengeveld, G.-J. Nabuurs, S. Pfautsch, H. Viana, A. C. Vibrans, C. Ammer, P. Schall, D. Verbyla, N. Tchebakova, M. Fischer, J. V. Watson, H. Y. H. Chen, X. Lei, M.-J. Schelhaas, H. Lu, D. Gianelle, E. I. Parfenova, C. Salas, E. Lee, B. Lee, H. S. Kim, H. Bruelheide, D. A. Coomes, D. Piotta, T. Sunderland, B. Schmid, S. Gourlet-Fleury, B. Sonké, R. Tavani, J. Zhu, S. Brandl, J. Vayreda, F. Kitahara, E. B. Searle, V. J. Neldner, M. R. Ngugi, C. Baraloto, L. Frizzera, R. Bałazy, J. Oleksyn, T. Zawila-

- Niedźwiecki, O. Bouriaud, F. Bussotti, L. Finér, B. Jaroszewicz, T. Jucker, F. Valladares, A. M. Jagodzinski, P. L. Peri, C. Gonmadje, W. Marthy, T. O'Brien, E. H. Martin, A. R. Marshall, F. Rovero, R. Bitariho, P. A. Niklaus, P. Alvarez-Loayza, N. Chamuya, R. Valencia, F. Mortier, V. Wortel, N. L. Engone-Obiang, L. V. Ferreira, D. E. Odeke, R. M. Vasquez, S. L. Lewis, P. B. Reich, Positive biodiversity-productivity relationship predominant in global forests. *Science* **354**, aaf8957 (2016).
186. J.-F. Lamarque, D. T. Shindell, B. Josse, P. J. Young, I. Cionni, V. Eyring, D. Bergmann, P. Cameron-Smith, W. J. Collins, R. Doherty, S. Dalsoren, G. Faluvegi, G. Folberth, S. J. Ghan, L. W. Horowitz, Y. H. Lee, I. A. MacKenzie, T. Nagashima, V. Naik, D. Plummer, M. Righi, S. T. Rumbold, M. Schulz, R. B. Skeie, D. S. Stevenson, S. Strode, K. Sudo, S. Szopa, A. Voulgarakis, G. Zeng, The Atmospheric Chemistry and Climate Model Intercomparison Project (ACCMIP): Overview and description of models, simulations and climate diagnostics. *Geosci. Model Dev.* **6**, 179–206 (2013).
187. G. Myhre, D. Shindell, F.-M. Bréon, W. Collins, J. Fuglestedt, J. Huang, D. Koch, J.-F. Lamarque, D. Lee, B. Mendoza, T. Nakajima, A. Robock, G. Stephens, T. Takemura, H. Zhang, Anthropogenic and natural radiative forcing, in *Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*, T. F. Stocker, D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S. K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex, P. M. Midgley, Eds. (Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 659–740.
188. B. Kirtman, S. B. Power, J. A. Adedoyin, G. J. Boer, R. Bojariu, I. Camilloni, F. Doblas-Reyes, A. M. Fiore, M. Kimoto, G. Meehl, M. Prather, A. Sarr, C. Schär, R. Sutton, G. Van Oldenborgh, G. Vecchi, H. J. Wang, Near-term climate change: projections and predictability, in *Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*, T. F. Stocker, D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S. K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex, P. M. Midgley, Eds. (Cambridge Univ. Press, 2013), .pp. 953–1028.
189. P. J. Young, A. T. Archibald, K. W. Bowman, J.-F. Lamarque, V. Naik, D. S. Stevenson, S. Tilmes, A. Voulgarakis, O. Wild, D. Bergmann, P. Cameron-Smith, I. Cionni, W. J. Collins, S. B. Dalsøren, R. M. Doherty, V. Eyring, G. Faluvegi, L. W. Horowitz, B. Josse, Y. H. Lee, I. A. MacKenzie, T. Nagashima, D. A. Plummer, M. Righi, S. T. Rumbold, R. B. Skeie, D.

- T. Shindell, S. A. Strode, K. Sudo, S. Szopa, G. Zeng, Pre-industrial to end 21st-century projections of tropospheric ozone from the Atmospheric Chemistry and Climate Model Intercomparison Project (ACCMIP). *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* **13**, 2063–2090 (2013).
190. N. Bousserrez, J. L. Attié, V. H. Peuch, M. Michou, G. Pfister, D. Edwards, L. Emmons, C. Mari, B. Barret, S. R. Arnold, A. Heckel, A. Richter, H. Schlager, A. Lewis, M. A. Avery, G. W. Sachse, E. V. Browell, J. W. Hair, Evaluation of the MOCAGE chemistry transport model during the ICARTT/ITOP experiment. *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.* **112**, D10S42 (2007).
191. H. Teyssèdre, M. Michou, H. L. Clark, B. Josse, F. Karcher, D. Oliviè, V.-H. Peuch, D. Saint-Martin, D. Cariolle, J.-L. Attiè, P. Nedèlec, P. Ricaud, V. Thouret, R. J. van der A, A. Volz-Thomas, F. Cheròux, A new tropospheric and stratospheric Chemistry and Transport Model MOCAGE-Climat for multi-year studies: Evaluation of the present-day climatology and sensitivity to surface processes. *Atmos. Chem. Phys.* **7**, 5815–5860 (2007).
192. E. Agathokleous, M. Kitao, Y. Kinose, A review study on ozone phytotoxicity metrics for setting critical levels in Asia. *Asian J. Atmos. Environ.* **12**, 1–16 (2018).
193. A. Anav, A. De Marco, C. Proietti, A. Alessandri, A. Dell’Aquila, I. Cionni, P. Friedlingstein, D. Khvorostyanov, L. Menut, E. Paoletti, P. Sicard, S. Sitch, M. Vitale, Comparing concentration-based (AOT40) and stomatal uptake (PODY) metrics for ozone risk assessment to European forests. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **22**, 1608–1627 (2016).
194. G. Mills, A. Buse, B. Gimeno, V. Bermejo, M. Holland, L. Emberson, H. Pleijel, A synthesis of AOT40-based response functions and critical levels of ozone for agricultural and horticultural crops. *Atmos. Environ.* **41**, 2630–2643 (2007).
195. LRTAP Convention, *Manual on Methodologies and Criteria for Modelling and Mapping Critical Loads and Levels and Air Pollution Effects, Risks and Trends. Chapter 3 Mapping Critical Levels for Vegetation* (UNECE Convention on Long-range Transboundary Air Pollution, 2017); <https://icpvegetation.ceb.ac.uk>.
196. E. Paoletti, W. J. Manning, Toward a biologically significant and usable standard for ozone that will also protect plants. *Environ. Pollut.* **150**, 85–95 (2007).
197. G. Kier, H. Kreft, T. M. Lee, W. Jetz, P. L. Ibsch, C. Nowicki, J. Mutke, W. Barthlott, A global assessment of endemism and species richness across island and mainland regions. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **106**, 9322–9327 (2009).
198. M. M. Millán, E. Mantilla, R. Salvador, A. Carratalá, M. J. Sanz, L. Alonso, G. Gangoi,

- M. Navazo, Ozone cycles in the western Mediterranean basin: Interpretation of monitoring data in complex terrain. *J. Appl. Meteorol.* **39**, 487–507 (2000).
199. P. Sicard, A. De Marco, F. Troussier, C. Renou, N. Vas, E. Paoletti, Decrease in surface ozone concentrations at Mediterranean remote sites and increase in the cities. *Atmos. Environ.* **79**, 705–715 (2013).
200. E. Oksanen, Responses of selected birch (*Betula pendula* Roth) clones to ozone change over time. *Plant Cell Environ.* **26**, 875–886 (2003).
201. E. A. Ainsworth, Understanding and improving global crop response to ozone pollution. *Plant J.* **90**, 886–897 (2017).
202. C. Vacher, A. Hampe, A. J. Porté, U. Sauer, S. Compant, C. E. Morris, The phyllosphere: Microbial jungle at the plant-climate interface. *Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst.* **47**, 1–24 (2016).
203. J. A. Vorholt, Microbial life in the phyllosphere. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* **10**, 828–840 (2012).
204. V. E. Wittig, E. A. Ainsworth, S. L. Naidu, D. F. Karnosky, S. P. Long, Quantifying the impact of current and future tropospheric ozone on tree biomass, growth, physiology and biochemistry: A quantitative meta-analysis. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **15**, 396–424 (2009).
205. R. Matyssek, G. Bahnweg, R. Ceulemans, P. Fabian, D. Grill, D. E. Hanke, H. Kraigher, W. Oßwald, H. Rennenberg, H. Sandermann, M. Tausz, G. Wieser, Synopsis of the CASIROZ case study: Carbon sink strength of *Fagus sylvatica* L. in a changing environment--experimental risk assessment of mitigation by chronic ozone impact. *Plant Biol.* **9**, 163–180 (2007).
206. A. S. Lefohn, H. Wernli, D. Shadwick, S. J. Oltmans, M. Shapiro, Quantifying the frequency of stratospheric-tropospheric transport affecting enhanced surface ozone concentrations at high- and low-elevation monitoring sites in the United States. *Atmos. Environ.* **62**, 646–656 (2012).
207. P. Sicard, R. Serra, P. Rossello, Spatiotemporal trends in ground-level ozone concentrations and metrics in France over the time period 1999–2012. *Environ. Res.* **149**, 122–144 (2016).
208. M. Legrand, S. Preunkert, B. Jourdain, H. Gallée, F. Goutail, R. Weller, J. Savarino, Year-round record of surface ozone at coastal (Dumont d’Urville) and inland (Concordia) sites in East Antarctica. *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.* **114**, D20306 (2009).
209. R. G. Derwent, C. S. Witham, S. R. Utembe, M. E. Jenkin, N. R. Passant, Ozone in Central England: The impact of 20 years of precursor emission controls in Europe. *Environ. Sci.*

- Policy* **13**, 195–204 (2010).
210. T. W. Walker, D. B. A. Jones, M. Parrington, D. K. Henze, L. T. Murray, J. W. Bottenheim, K. Anlauf, J. R. Worden, K. W. Bowman, C. Shim, K. Singh, M. Kopacz, D. W. Tarasick, J. Davies, P. Von Der Gathen, A. M. Thompson, C. C. Carouge, Impacts of midlatitude precursor emissions and local photochemistry on ozone abundances in the Arctic. *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.* **117**, D01305 (2012).
211. J. L. Innes, J. M. Skelly, M. Schaub, *Ozone and Broadleaved Species. A Guide to the Identification of Ozone-Induced Foliar Injury* (Birmensdorf: Eidgenössische Forschungsanstalt WSL, 2001).
212. M. Schaub, P. Jakob, L. Bernhard, J. L. Innes, J. M. Skelly, N. Kräuchi, *Ozone Injury Database* (Swiss Federal Research Institute WSL, 2002).
213. P. Sicard, N. Vas, V. Calatayud, F. J. García-Breijó, J. Reig-Armiñana, M. J. Sanz, L. Dalstein-Richier, Dommages forestiers et pollution à l’ozone dans les réserves naturelles: Le cas de l’arolle dans le sud-est de la France. *Forêt Méditerranéenne*. **31**, 273–286 (2010).
214. K. O. Burkey, E. Agathokleous, C. J. Saitanis, A. M. Mashaheet, T. Koike, Y.-T. Hung, in *Handbook of Environmental and Waste Management Volume 3, Acid Rain and Greenhouse Gas Pollution Control*, Y.-T. Hung, L. K. Wang, N. K. Shamma, Eds. (World Scientific Publishing Co., 2020), p. 1055. ISBN-10: 9811207127.
215. L. Dalstein, X. Torti, D. Le Thiec, P. Dizengremel, Physiological study of declining cembra pines (*Pinus cembra* L.) in southern France. *Trees* **16**, 299–305 (2002).
216. L. Dalstein, N. Vas, F. Tagliaferro, A. M. Ferrara, F. Spaziani, Effets de l’ozone sur la forêt et la végétation dans les Alpes franco-italiennes. *Forêt méditerranéenne* **t. XXVI**, 149–156 (2005).
217. G. Wieser, W. J. Manning, M. Tausz, A. Bytnerowicz, Evidence for potential impacts of ozone on *Pinus cembra* L. at mountain sites in Europe: An overview. *Environ. Pollut.* **139**, 53–58 (2006).
218. V. Calatayud, J. Cerveró, M. J. Sanz, Foliar, physiological and growth responses of four maple species exposed to ozone. *Water Air Soil Pollut.* **185**, 239–254 (2007).
219. M. S. Günthardt-Goerg, P. Vollenweider, Linking stress with macroscopic and microscopic leaf response in trees: New diagnostic perspectives. *Environ. Pollut.* **147**, 467–488 (2007).
220. N. Contran, E. Paoletti, Visible foliar injury and physiological responses to ozone in Italian



- provenances of *Fraxinus excelsior* and *F. ornus*. *ScientificWorldJournal* **7**, 90–97 (2007).
221. N. E. Grulke, E. Paoletti, R. L. Heath, Comparison of calculated and measured foliar O<sub>3</sub> flux in crop and forest species. *Environ. Pollut.* **146**, 640–647 (2007).
222. K. Novak, M. Schaub, J. Fuhrer, J. M. Skelly, B. Frey, N. Kräuchi, Ozone effects on visible foliar injury and growth of *Fagus sylvatica* and *Viburnum lantana* seedlings grown in monoculture or in mixture. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* **62**, 212–220 (2008).
223. S. N. Singh, *Climate Change and Crops. Environmental Science and Engineering* (Springer-Verlag, 2009).
224. M. Schaub, V. Calatayud, M. Ferretti, G. Brunialti, G. Lövblad, G. Krause, M. J. Sanz, in *Manual on Methods and Criteria for Harmonized Sampling, Assessment, Monitoring and Analysis of the Effects of Air Pollution on Forests* (UNECE ICP Forests Programme, 2010), p. 22.
225. J. M. Skelly, J. L. Innes, J. E. Savage, K. R. Snyder, D. Vanderheyden, J. Zhang, M. J. Sanz, in *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution* (Springer, 1999), vol. 116, pp. 227–234.
226. C. J. Saitanis, S. M. Bari, K. O. Burkey, D. Stamatelopoulos, E. Agathokleous, Screening of Bangladeshi winter wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) cultivars for sensitivity to ozone. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* **21**, 13560–13571 (2014).
227. S. Brace, D. L. Peterson, D. Bowers, *A Guide to Ozone Injury in Vascular Plants of the Pacific Northwest* - [United States Department of Agriculture Forest Service, Pacific Northwest Research Station, General Technical Report PNW-GTR-446, September 1999 (1999)].
228. M. J. Sanz, G. Sanchez, V. Calatayud, M. T. Minaya, J. Cervero, *La Contaminacion Atmosferica en los Bosques: Guia para la identificacion de danos visibles causados por ozono* (Organismo Autonomo de Parques Nacionales, 2001).
229. C. J. Saitanis, M. G. Karandinos, Effects of ozone on tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum* L.) varieties. *J. Agron. Crop Sci.* **188**, 51–58 (2002).
230. E. Agathokleous, C. J. Saitanis, K. O. Burkey, G. Ntatsi, V. Vougeleka, A. M. Mashaheet, A. Pallides, Application and further characterization of the snap bean S156/R123 ozone biomonitoring system in relation to ambient air temperature. *Sci. Total Environ.* **580**, 1046–1055 (2017).
231. K. Stolte, Symptomology of Ozone Injury to Pine Foliage, in *Evaluating Ozone Air*

- Pollution Effects on Pines in the Western United States*, P. R. Miller, K. W. Stolte, D. M. Duriscoe, J. Pronos, Eds. (USDA Forest Service General Technical Report PSW-GTR-155, Pacific Southwest Research Station, Forest Service US Department of Agriculture, 1996).
232. F. Tagliaferro, A. M. Ferrara, F. Spaziani, E. Viotto, Sintomi fogliari di tipo ozono like su vegetazione spontanea e ornamentale in Piemonte. *Linea Ecol.* **27**, 47–53 (2005).
233. G. Wieser, R. Häsler, B. Götz, W. Koch, W. M. Havranek, Role of climate, crown position, tree age and altitude in calculated ozone flux into needles of *Picea abies* and *Pinus cembra*: A synthesis. *Environ. Pollut.* **109**, 415–422 (2000).
234. P. Sicard, L. Dalstein-richier, N. Vas, Annual and seasonal trends of ambient ozone concentration and its impact on forest vegetation in Mercantour National Park (South-eastern France) over the 2000–2008 period. *Environ. Pollut.* **159**, 351–362 (2011).
235. M. S. Günthardt-Goerg, P. Vollenweider, C. J. McQuattie, Differentiation of ozone, heavy metal or biotic stress in leaves and needles. *Ekològia.* **22**, 110–113 (2003).
236. P. Vollenweider, M. Ottiger, M. S. Günthardt-Goerg, Validation of leaf ozone symptoms in natural vegetation using microscopical methods. *Environ. Pollut.* **124**, 101–118 (2003).
237. R. Kohut, *Handbook for Assessment of Foliar Ozone Injury on Vegetation in the National Parks* (National Park Service, U.S. Department of the Interior, Air Resources Division, 2005).
238. P. Vollenweider, M. S. Günthardt-Goerg, Diagnosis of abiotic and biotic stress factors using the visible symptoms in foliage. *Environ. Pollut.* **137**, 455–465 (2005).
239. S. Anttonen, J. Herranen, P. Peura, L. Kärenlampi, Fatty acids and ultrastructure of ozone-exposed Aleppo pine (*Pinus halepensis* Mill.) needles. *Environ. Pollut.* **87**, 235–242 (1995).
240. M. Kivimäenpää, S. Sutinen, V. Calatayud, M. J. Sanz, Visible and microscopic needle alterations of mature Aleppo pine (*Pinus halepensis*) trees growing on an ozone gradient in eastern Spain. *Tree Physiol.* **30**, 541–554 (2010).
241. T. Holopainen, S. Anttonen, A. Wulff, V. Palomäki, L. Kärenlampi, Comparative evaluation of the effects of gaseous pollutants, acidic deposition and mineral deficiencies: Structural changes in the cells of forest plants. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **42**, 365–398 (1992).
242. E. Pääkkönen, T. Holopainen, L. Kärenlampi, Ageing-related anatomical and ultrastructural changes in leaves of birch (*Betula pendula* Roth.) clones as affected by low ozone exposure. *Ann. Bot.* **75**, 285–294 (1995).

243. T. N. Mikkelsen, H. S. Heide-Jørgensen, Acceleration of leaf senescence in *Fagus sylvatica* L. by low levels of tropospheric ozone demonstrated by leaf colour, chlorophyll fluorescence and chloroplast ultrastructure. *Trees* **10**, 145–156 (1996).
244. L. Nazarenko, G. A. Schmidt, R. L. Miller, N. Tausnev, M. Kelley, R. Ruedy, G. L. Russell, I. Aleinov, M. Bauer, S. Bauer, R. Bleck, V. Canuto, Y. Cheng, T. L. Clune, A. D. Del Genio, G. Faluvegi, J. E. Hansen, R. J. Healy, N. Y. Kiang, D. Koch, A. A. Lacis, A. N. Le Grande, J. Lerner, K. K. Lo, S. Menon, V. Oinas, J. Perlwitz, M. J. Puma, D. Rind, A. Romanou, M. Sato, D. T. Shindell, S. Sun, K. Tsigaridis, N. Unger, A. Voulgarakis, M.-S. Yao, J. Zhang, Future climate change under RCP emission scenarios with GISS ModelE2. *J. Adv. Model. Earth Syst.* **7**, 244–267 (2015).
245. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, in *Climate Change 2014: Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability. Contribution of Working Group II to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*, C. B. Field, V.R. Barros, D. J. Dokken, K. J. Mach, M. D. Mastrandrea, T. E. Bilir, M. Chatterjee, K. L. Ebi, Y. O. Estrada, R. C. Genova, B. Girma, E. S. Kissel, A. N. Levy, S. MacCracken, P. R. Mastrandrea, L. L. White, Eds. (Cambridge University Press, 2014), 1132 pp.
246. D. J. Seidel, Q. Fu, W. J. Randel, T. J. Reiohler, Widening of the tropical belt in a changing climate. *Nat. Geosci.* **1**, 21–24 (2008).
247. J. P. Tuovinen, Assessing vegetation exposure to ozone: Properties of the AOT40 index and modifications by deposition modelling. *Environ. Pollut.* **109**, 361–372 (2000).
248. P. A. Evans, M. R. Ashmore, The effects of ambient air on a semi-natural grassland community. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **38**, 91–97 (1992).
249. K. Rämö, T. Kanerva, S. Nikula, K. Ojanperä, S. Manninen, Influences of elevated ozone and carbon dioxide in growth responses of lowland hay meadow mesocosms. *Environ. Pollut.* **144**, 101–111 (2006).
250. H. Pleijel, G. Pihl Karlsson, E. Sild, H. Danielsson, L. Skärby, G. Selldén, Exposure of a grass-clover mixture to ozone in open-top chambers - Effects on yield, quality and botanical composition. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **59**, 55–62 (1996).
251. M. Volk, P. Bungener, F. Contat, M. Montani, J. Fuhrer, Grassland yield declined by a quarter in 5 years of free-air ozone fumigation. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **12**, 74–83 (2006).